

in the MAI and in Tijuana, and to formulate *recommendations* based on our field research and analysis. We suggest the key is to keep the focus on the defined profile of the migrant women whom the MAI seeks to assist. This is important if the assistance is intended to be long term; thus, the evaluation can review the strategies used and adjust the work to correct inconsistencies. Furthermore, it is important to strengthen cooperation networks among different institutions (public and civil society) working with migrants. In this way, it would be possible to establish the MAI's position as an institution that can legitimately direct specific demands to public institutions and civil society organisations not only in Tijuana but also at the international level.

References

Botega, T., Dutra, D., Vince, N., Cunha, I. 2018. 'Rebuilding Life in the Border. Assistance and Support to Migrants in the Northern Border of Mexico.' Brasília: SCMS.

Care Work Migration from and to East-Central Europe

Noémi Katona, Eszter Turai

Due to demographic changes in Europe there is an increasing number of dependent elderly people in need of care. This has serious effects on the labour market and migration in the EU as well. European governments face difficulties in maintaining welfare services for their elderly population; therefore, they seek cheaper migrant labour. In line with the global commodity chain the reproductive labour of women is also governed by market relations, which is manifested in global care chains (Parreñas 2001). Eastern-Central-European (ECE) countries are on the one hand receiving countries, as women from third countries provide care services there. On the other hand, they are sending countries, as a large number of ECE women perform care work in Western Europe.

What social background do migrant carers have and what motivates them to leave their homes? Under what conditions do they work abroad? Who defines these conditions and what would fair care work look like? What are the structural causes behind carers' migration and what consequences does this migration have for their home countries? The Gender Equality Programme of the Friedrich Ebert Foundation Budapest organised a workshop on care migration from/to ECE, which aimed to initiate a discussion among experts on care work migration from within the region. The main

aim of the international exchange was to study care work from a political-economy perspective and to provide insight into the lived experiences of care givers.

Experts from ECE, Germany and Austria participated in the workshop. Miloslav Bahna, a senior researcher at the Slovak Academy of Sciences, studies Slovak migrant workers providing care in Austria (Bahna, Sekulová 2019). Petra Ezzeddine, an assistant professor at Charles University in Prague, is an anthropologist focusing on migrant care workers in the Czech Republic (Ezzeddine 2014; Hradečná et al. 2013). Dóra Gábrriel, from the Hungarian Demographic Research Institute (Melegh et al. 2018), and Krisztina Németh and Mónika Váradi, from the Hungarian Academy of Sciences (Németh, Váradi 2018), do research on Hungarian migrant care workers from rural Hungary. Kinga Milánkovics is a Hungarian social entrepreneur, founder of 'Conscious Aging', and works as a carer in the UK. Ana Maria Preoteasa, a senior researcher at the Romanian Academy, studies Romanian migrant care workers in Italy from a life-course perspective (Preoteasa 2018). Olena Fedyuk is an independent film-maker and researcher (Fedyuk et al. 2014a; Fedyuk et al. 2014b), and her documentary on a Ukrainian care worker in Italy, *Olha's Italian Diary*, was screened at the event. Aranka Benazha from Goethe University, Germany, and Veronika Prieler from Johannes Kepler University in Linz are members of a comparative German-Austrian-Swiss project *Decent Care Work? Transnational Home Care Arrangements* (<http://decent-care-work.net/>). The project studies 24-hour live-in care services, how care arrangements are getting commodified, and what social differentiations and inequalities they generate (Steiner et al. 2019).

Care work migration from a political economy perspective

From a political-economy perspective, migration is defined by macroeconomic processes that produce socio-spatial inequalities. As Bridget Anderson (2001) explains, migration is embedded economically, socially, and politically at the local, national, regional, and global levels. The demand for female labour is deeply embedded in social constructions of race and gender and is defined by demographic pressures.

Miloslav Bahna argued that care migration further reinforces regional inequalities and he highlighted the crucial role of unemployment and in the source country and wage differences in care migration. He explained that the economic crisis in 2009 caused high unemployment, especially in East Slovakia, which strongly increased care work migration from this region. However, previously unemployed women commonly got lower paid jobs in care work, and generally, most care workers got less prestigious jobs after returning to Slovakia. Dóra Gábrriel explained that the typical motive for rural Hungarian women to migrate was a serious economic situation, such as debt, unemployment, and poverty, often combined with a family crisis. As opposed to the neoclassical understanding of work migration, she found that their decision-

making process was not individual but rather a family decision, and it was not based on rational calculations of costs and benefits, and often many hidden costs were not considered, such as the hardship of 24-hour service, or the lack of a pension from the receiving country. Gábiel claimed that care migration commonly reinforces gender inequality.

The role of recruitment agencies

As Benazha explained, the economisation and privatisation of public goods have led to an expanded market for elderly care services. States benefit from the marketisation of care, since migrant care workers have started to fill in the existing gap in welfare services at a very low cost. As several hundreds of such profit-oriented agencies facilitate the migration of care workers within Europe, an institutionalised, highly competitive, fragmented market has developed that defines the wages and costs of care work. Additionally, since the state failed to create sufficient regulations for the care sector, migrant carers commonly work in a legal twilight zone that increases their vulnerability. Benazha pointed out that the state and the agencies are the two main beneficiaries of the marketisation of care, and they describe it in a neoliberal 'win-win' framing, regardless of the many conflicting interests and power-imbalances that exist and commonly suppress carers' interests.

Benazha explained that in Germany the most common type of employment is posting, which is the most profitable practice for agencies and the most insecure one for workers. It is sometimes combined with self-employment and less than 10% of the workers are involved in regular employment. Milánkovichs, who works as a live-in carer, highlighted the advantages of the UK model. She compared various employment models and agencies and claimed that self-employment provides the best working conditions. However, it is rather available for those migrant carers who already know the UK system. Milánkovichs noted the crucial role of the Care Quality Commission, which is a state-financed but independent regulatory body. It assures quality control, which protects both workers and clients. Agencies can join this institution if they meet its requirements, which serves as good branding for them. While in this system the agencies' business interest is to provide good services, many other agencies outside of this system have much more exploitative practices. Prieler also highlighted that regular quality control of agencies, initial information, and transparency would increase safety for workers and clients. Training and qualifications would further improve the situation of workers and lead to higher income. However, in contrast to Milánkovichs, Prieler argued that the self-employment model should be replaced by more secure organisation-based employment.

The privatisation of care results in the marketisation of care workers themselves. Ezzeddine focused on the nationalised and ethnicised marketing of care workers

in the Czech Republic. The majority of migrant carers comes from Ukraine and the Philippines. They are in a vulnerable situation because their citizenship status leaves them dependent on agencies and employers. Agencies construct an ideal type of care worker and depict these ideal care workers on their websites and in their marketing materials as attractive, always smiling, affectionate, and sensitive. Similarly, Prieler show how Austrian agencies portray carers as young white women smiling in a quasi-family picture together with their clients. Relying on the strong ethos of home care in Germany and Austrian society, agencies frame 24-hour care as a family relationship in contrast to institutional care. These framings hide not only the precarious situation of the family carers, but also the fact that most carers perform physically and mentally demanding work.

Olha's Italian diary and the narratives of care migration

The motivation and lived experiences of migrant care workers are mainly analysed in qualitative studies. Individual life courses, as Preoteasa explained, 'are shaped by their personal agency, the historical and geographical context, the linked lives, and the institutional constraints'. Studies focusing on the narratives of migration highlight the complex relationships between agency and structural constraints.

Krisztina Németh and Mónika Mária Váradi conducted interviews with female migrant care workers from rural Hungary and explored the narratives of agency. They found two different ideal types of narrative: the classical 'housemaid narrative', which is dominated by feelings of anger and frustration resulting from the unequal power relations between carers and clients; and the less common 'self-development narrative', in which carers describe migration as an opportunity that allows them to free themselves from oppressive relations at home. The young Romanian care workers in Germany and Austria, whom Preoteasa interviewed, described care migration as an important step in growing up, thus it meant an early transition to adulthood. However, because of their lack of qualifications in care work, most women could not achieve any upward mobility or better pay in care work and had to work in difficult working conditions.

Olena Fedyuk's documentary, *Olha's Italian Diary*, depicted the everyday life and emotional attachments of a middle-aged Ukrainian care worker. The film showed a successful migration project (Fedyuk), which Milánkovics also supported and argued that migration can also mean empowerment, like in the case of Olha, who has a better life in Italy than at home in the Ukraine. In contrast to that, Preoteasa emphasised the hardship of the blurry boundary between rest and work time as a specific psychological problem of this job, along with the feeling of loneliness that stems from being cut off from one's family. Since sustaining meaningful relationships from a distance is hard, these linkages become highly unidirectional. At the same time,

there is often pressure from the family that it is inappropriate for migrant mothers to have fun or have a full life while they are abroad, something that was also shown in Fedjuk's movie.

Conclusion

As the presentations and discussions in this workshop showed, migrant care workers' vulnerable or precarious position in the labour market strongly defines their decision to migrate and impacts their working conditions and their future perspectives after returning. While the economic situation of the countries of origin defines the motivation to migrate, receiving states play an important role with respect to improving the working conditions of care workers by providing stricter regulations of employing carers and ensuring safer and fairer working conditions. Recruitment agencies operate on a market basis and commonly exploit vulnerable workers. However, they can also be a reliable, useful actor in providing safety for both clients and carers by establishing clear rules for working agreements.

This workshop sought to offer an opportunity for mutual learning. Several questions and issues were raised that need further elaboration. Academic work aims primarily to gain and deepen knowledge; however, highlighting the inequalities in care work can also serve the interests of care workers from the ECE and help to achieve fairer working conditions and regulations. Hopefully this exchange was not a one-time discussion, and that communication and cooperation among experts will continue.

References

- Anderson, B. 2001. *Reproductive Labour and Migration*. [online] WPTC-02-01. [cit. 10/06/2019] Available from: <http://www.transcomm.ox.ac.uk/working%20papers/WPTC-02-01%20Anderson.doc.pdf>.
- Bahna, M., Sekulová, M. 2019. *Crossborder Care - Lessons from Central Europe*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ezzeddine, P. 2014. 'Who Cares? (Ageing, Care and Migration).' *Urban People/Lidé města*, Vol. 16, No. 2: 219-237.
- Bartha, A., Zentai, V. 2014. *Migrant Domestic Care Workers: State and Market-Based Policy Mix*. Budapest: NEUJOBS.
- Fedyuk, O., Bartha, A., Zentai, V. 2014. *The Role of Migrant Labour in Meeting European Care Demand*. Budapest: NEUJOBS.
- Hradečná, P., Jelínková, M., Ezzeddine, P., Havelková, H. 2016. *Women at the Sidelines(?): Gender, Migration and Ageing*. Prague: SIMI.
- Melegh, A., Gábel, D., Gresits, G., Hámos, D. 2018. 'Abandoned Hungarian Workers and the Political Economy of Care Work in Austria.' *Review of Sociology*, Vol. 28, No. 4: 61–87.

- Németh, K., Váradi, M. M. 2018. 'Development in the Context of Care Migration from Rural Hungary: An Agency-Based Approach.' *Review of Sociology*, Vol. 28, No. 4: 88–110.
- Parreñas, R. S. 2001. *Servants of Globalization*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Preoteasa, A. M. 2018. 'Women's Stories of Migration: Youth, Personal Agency, and Linked Lives.' Pp. 171-193 in I. Vlase, B. Voicu (eds.). *Gender, Family, and Adaptation of Migrants in Europe. A Life Course Perspective*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Steiner, J., Prieler, V., Leiblfinger, M., Benazha, A. 2019. 'Völlig legal!? Rechtliche Rahmung und Legalitäts-narrative in der 24h-Betreuung in Deutschland, Österreich und der Schweiz.' *Österreichische Zeitschrift für Soziologie*, Vol. 44, No. 1: 1–19.

Změna vnímání genderové rovnosti ve státní správě prostřednictvím nové evropské legislativy?

Markéta Švarcová

Velký zrcadlový sál v Karmelitské ulici na Ministerstvu školství, mládeže a tělovýchovy hostil zahraničního hosta a hostku z významných evropských institucí, aby mohli předstížit zkušenosti s implementací genderové rovnosti ve státní správě. Prvního dubna se uskutečnil kulatý stůl s názvem „Genderová rovnost a státní správa: Zkušenosti z Evropské komise a OECD“ pořádaný Ministerstvem školství, mládeže a tělovýchovy, respektive týmem projektu Genderová rovnost na MŠMT. Klíčovým tématem bylo zavádění genderových opatření do struktur veřejné správy. Pozvání přijaly dvě zahraniční expertky a jeden zahraniční expert. Úvodní části kulatého stolu se rovněž účastnili zástupci nejvyšších pater ministerské struktury. Jednání otevřel státní tajemník Jindřich Fryč za přítomnosti náměstka člena vlády Petra Pavlíka. Hlavní hostkou však byla Tatyana Temple, zástupkyně Organizace pro hospodářskou spolupráci a rozvoj (OECD), která působí jako senior konzultantka a vedoucí odboru pro řízení v oblasti genderu, spravedlnosti a inkluze na Ředitelství pro veřejnou správu při OECD. Jako specialistka na tvorbu mezinárodních standardů a poradenství vládám zemí OECD zaměřila svou prezentaci především na genderovou rovnost ve veřejné správě. Temple poukazovala zejména na význam genderového mainstreamingu v různých oblastech politik, které jsou mimo jiné i pod záštitou Evropské komise uskutečňovány v rámci Strategického závazku v oblasti rovnosti žen a mužů na období 2016–2019. Temple rovněž shrnula stav genderové rovnosti v oblastech své působnosti a upozornila na to, že ač se může v určitých oblastech politik zdát, že genderové rovnosti bylo dosaženo *de jure*, realita je *de facto* jiná. Závěrem uvítala iniciativu organizátorů a organizátorek kulatého stolu a pobídla je k trpělivosti v rámci jejich činnosti.